



Fish Contamination Education Collaborative Partners Meeting

2 November 2022

1 PM to 3 PM

EPA Region 9 Southern California Field Office 600

Wilshire Blvd, Suite 940

Los Angeles, CA 90017

Attendees (21):

Cabrillo Marine Aquarium (Cabrillo):

Carl Carranza
Bayne Westrick-Snapp

California Department of Toxic Substance Control (DTSC):

Chinh Sheow
Daniel Cordero
Jessica Anderson

Daniel B. Stephens & Associates (DBS&A):

Heather Hackstedde
John Dodge

EA Engineering, Science, and Technology, Inc. (EA):

Laura Levine

Heal the Bay (HTB):

Frankie Orrala*
Katherine Pease*
Kayleigh Wade*

Los Angeles County Sanitation District (LACSD):

Chi-Li Tang*

Los Angeles Regional Water Quality Control Board (RWQCB)

Thanhloan Nguyen

National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA):

Dave Witting

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA):

Judy Huang*
Renee Jordan Ward*
Erica Yelensky*
Romie Duarte*

Santa Monica Bay Restoration Commission:

Marisa Caringella

Sea Lab:

Maria Madrigal

United States Geological Survey (USGS):

Chris Sherwood

*In-person attendance

1. Welcome – Laura Levine/EA

Ms. Levine opened the meeting by thanking partners for their participation. Ms. Levine reviewed the agenda and thanked EPA for use of the facility for the meeting. She mentioned that this is an update from the last meeting in March 2022 and that data summarized in the upcoming presentations will be the period between March 2022 and October 2022. See [EA's presentation slides](#) for more information.

2. EPA Update – Judy Huang/EPA

Ms. Huang introduced Renee Jordan Ward as the new EPA Remedial Project Manager (RPM) who will work on the community involvement portion of the of the Palos Verdes Shelf project. Ms. Huang thanked everyone for their continued support and gave a brief update that the most recent round of sediment and water samples is complete, and EPA will release the results next year.

3. Angler Outreach Update

Angler Outreach Program – Laura Levine/EA

Ms. Levine presented a summary of the pier angler outreach program data since the last meeting in March 2022. The data summary included the total number of people contacted through the various outreach programs. The following is a summary of the program outreach data.

Pier Angler Outreach (Includes outreach data from HTB and Cabrillo):

- Angler outreach contacted 6,904 people
- 3,254 were new (47 percent)
- 5,027 were aware of contamination (~73 percent)
- 1,003 tip cards were handed out in English and Spanish.

Ms. Levine showed graphics of the angler outreach and awareness sources by month. She stated that data indicates that peak angler outreach occurred during the summer/warmer months (June through September) and that the Do Not Consume (DNC) pier signage, tip cards, and angler outreach are the most effective sources of spreading awareness of the fish contamination. The remaining awareness sources were less influential such as media, friend/family, tip cards, internet, community events, and other sources (e.g., school).

She also mentioned that a total of 69 DNC pier fish signs were reported in July 2020. As of July 2022, there are 50 total signs of which 19 are missing and 16 are damaged and need replacement.

Cabrillo Update – Carl Carranza/Cabrillo

Mr. Carranza presented the angler outreach and awareness sources data for the period March through September 2022. During the period, 1,102 anglers were reached. Of those reached, 22.5 percent were new anglers and 82.1 percent were already aware of the contamination.

Angler outreach and DNC pier signage were the most effective at spreading awareness of fish contamination.

Mr. Carranza presented the status of the eight DNC pier signs at Cabrillo pier. The signs are dirty, weathered, and/or bent but they are still readable.

Mr. Carranza also noted that less white croakers have been spotted at the piers, and that it appears that more people are aware of the DNC pier signage than they were pre-pandemic. He was unable to confirm the amount of white croaker sightings and catches.

HTB Update – Frankie Orrala/HTB

Mr. Orrala discussed the mission of HTB and the objectives of the pier angler outreach program. He listed the eight piers between Santa Monica and Seal Beach where HTB conducts the educational outreach, noting that they generally conduct outreach three times per week during the day and once per week in the evening. Mr. Orrala introduced the personnel on their outreach team with the capacity to conduct the outreach in English, Spanish, and Chinese.

Between March 2022 and October 2022, HTB’s angler outreach team contacted a total of 5,802 anglers; 52 percent of those were “new” participants (meaning they had not received outreach previously). Additionally, 71 percent of the anglers reached during the day were aware of the contamination. During evening hours, 75 percent of anglers were aware of the contamination.

Mr. Orrala then provided a bar graph presenting the new and repeat participants in total (all piers), by month, and then several graphs that indicated the number of participants per month by pier. The numbers showed similar trends with increased numbers of participants as the summer reached its peak in July 2022. Based on the data presented, summer is the busiest season, while the highest ratio of new to returning anglers is in the spring. The busiest piers are Redondo Beach and Venice Beach.

Based on the data collected by HTB and Cabrillo between March 2022 and September 2022, the most common awareness sources during the day outreach were the DNC pier signs, tip cards, and angler outreach team.

Mr. Orrala presented a summary of the DNC pier sign conditions for the 8 piers HTB monitors during angler outreach and those monitored in July 2022 at the remaining 10 piers formerly monitored by the City of Long Beach and Los Angeles County Department of Public Health (LACDPH) Toxics Epidemiology Branch. He reported a total number of 42 signs at 11 piers. The remaining DNC pier signs at 7 piers were not located. HTB reported that many signs were missing and/or observed to be in poor or bad condition. He presented the following main observations:

- Santa Monica Pier – Historically, there were 6 DNC pier signs at this location. Currently, there are 5 DNC pier signs in good condition. HTB thinks that the City of Santa Monica removed the 6th sign because it was not well located. HTB recommends replacing the sign on the north end of the pier where there is no coverage and anglers frequent.

- Venice Pier – Historically there were 6 signs at this pier. In June-July 2022, there were 5 DNC pier signs in good condition. As of today, HTB noticed that an additional sign is missing making the total of 4 DNC pier signs in good condition.
- Hermosa Pier – A DNC pier sign that was formerly located on a trashcan was removed. The remaining 4 DNC signs provide good coverage and are in good (2) and poor condition (2).
- Redondo Beach Pier – The 6 DNC pier signs are well located and need cleaning.
- Pier J – There is 1 DNC pier sign missing. The remaining 3 DNC pier signs are in excellent condition and well located, yet they are difficult to view at 9 feet high. Pier renovations were performed during the pandemic and fishing was prohibited. There are 2 new renovated pier structures that signs may be relocated to.
- Rainbow Harbor – There are 5 DNC pier signs of which 1 is missing. Two of the DNC pier signs are located near parking structures and are not well located for anglers.
- Belmont Pier – All 5 DNC pier signs are in good condition. They are well located and approximately 8 feet high.
- Seal Beach Piers – All 5 DNC pier signs are in good condition and well located. The pier was renovated during the pandemic.
- Ballona Creek – Of the 4 total DNC pier signs at Ballona Creek, 2 are missing, 1 is still readable, and 1 needs to be replaced. Ballona Creek pier is a rocky jetty, and the parking is located far from the pier. HTB observed sport anglers who fish with a license at this location, but subsistence fishing was not observed. HTB recommends relocating these signs.
- El Porto El Segundo – There is 1 DNC pier sign in good condition located on a parking structure. HTB recommends relocating this sign because there is not much angler traffic in this area.
- Royal Palm piers – There are 2 DNC pier signs that are in good and poor condition. The signs are located on a lifeguard tower which is not well situated to the areas with the most angler traffic and recommends relocation. HTB noted that there are no existing poles or structures in this area to hang signs.

Mr. Orrala presented a graphic showing the zip code analysis of where anglers come from. The data from 2018-2019 indicates that not all pier anglers are located along the pier coastal areas and travel from inland areas of Los Angeles to fish. FCEC partners may use the data to target future angler and community outreach.

Questions

1. Romie Duarte/EPA asked if EPA would replace the missing signs.

Ms. Huang/EPA responded that the DNC pier signage locations should be evaluated by FCEC partners. The DNC pier signs that are currently located in less trafficked areas can replace damaged/missing signs at piers with heavier angler traffic.

2. Ms. Levine/EA asked what inland cities or neighborhoods are shown on the graphic and what can be noted about the differences between 2018 and 2019.

Katherine Pease/HTB responded that the top zip codes are from the cities of Hawthorne, Rosemead, Compton, and San Gabriel Valley. The difference between 2018 and 2019 is not significant and indicates some movement within neighborhoods of the cities with top angler zip codes.

3. Erica Yelensky/EPA asked how HTB gathered the zip code survey data and whether the graphic show data from all piers.

Mr. Orrala responded that HTB compiled data from all angler outreach piers they manage and from direct in person interviews during angler outreach (i.e., Angler Outreach Tally Form). The zip codes include only the anglers who indicated they are new to the piers.

4. Enforcement Update California Department of Fish and Wildlife (CDFW) - Laura Levine for Lieutenant Michael Vicknair

Ms. Levine presented the enforcement summary for CDFW. CDFW performed 91 recreational fishing and 4 commercial business inspections between January and September 2022. Of 1,830 people reached, CDFW issued 1 citation and seizure of white croakers found to exceed the bag limit (35). Additionally, CDFW observed 85 white croakers in possession. No violations were issued at the 4 commercial businesses inspected.

Based on annual program reporting recommendations, CDFW updated their Enforcement Tally Form to track tip card distribution amount and languages as well as awareness sources. CDFW reported that they distributed 346 tip cards in English, Spanish, Chinese, and Vietnamese. The awareness sources were primarily DNC pier signs and tip cards.

CDFW recommended expanding enforcement outreach to areas north of Santa Monica and south of Huntington Beach piers to increase geographical area and outreach awareness. CDFW has observed white croaker catches in Bolsa Chica, Huntington Harbor and Huntington Beach areas.

City of Long Beach

The grant expired in 2019, therefore they did not perform fish market/restaurant inspections.

LACDPH

The grant expired in February 2022; therefore, they did not perform fish market/restaurant inspections.

4. Community Outreach Update

Community Outreach Program Update – Laura Levine/EA

Ms. Levine presented a summary of the community outreach program data since the last meeting in March 2022. The data summary included the total number of people

contacted through the various outreach programs. The following is a summary of the program outreach data.

Community Outreach:

Includes outreach data from DBS&A, Boat People SOS (BPSOS), and Chinese Herald Christian Crusades (CHCC).

- ~44.5K attendees and 3,644 tip cards handed out in English, Spanish, Chinese, and Vietnamese
- Included local, Hispanic, African American, Chinese, and Vietnamese audiences
- Modified bait shop outreach performed In August 2022, 1,250 tip cards distributed in English, Spanish, Chinese, and Vietnamese
- Outreach materials inventory is low and the Booth in the Box and fishing game materials for community events need replacement.

Community and Bait Shop Outreach by DBS&A – Heather Hackstedde/DBS&A

Community Event Outreach

Ms. Hackstedde summarized the community outreach activities performed since March 2022. DBS&A attended 4 events targeting local, Asian, and Latin American communities. There were approximately 32,000 attendees and 222 tip cards distributed in English, Spanish, Chinese, and Vietnamese. She observed that 1-5 percent of community event attendees were aware of the fish contamination while approximately 20 percent of them fish for themselves or their families.

Ms. Hackstedde mentioned that the Los Angeles County Department of Parks and Recreation, targeting children, has halted all upcoming events for the winter months.

Ms. Hackstedde also indicated that the tip card inventory is running low and components of the fishing game need replacement. For instance, 4 of the 6 fishing rods are broken and the magnets on the fabric fish are not very strong to catch with the fishing rod.

Bait Shop Outreach

Ms. Hackstedde also summarized the outreach activities performed in August 2022 at 37 bait shops located, from north to south, in Huntington Beach, Seal Beach, Long Beach, San Pedro, Redondo Beach, Hermosa Beach, Manhattan Beach, Hawthorne, Marina Del Rey, Venice, and Santa Monica. Three bait shops previously monitored either went out of business, or no longer sell bait. DBS&A will suggest replacement bait shops for the next round outreach in 2023.

During the bait shop outreach in August 2022, DBS&A conducted a modified outreach by calling the bait shops prior to delivering tip cards. As a result, 15 shops did not respond, 9 shops requested more materials, and 13 shops had enough materials. DBS&A distributed a total of 450 English, 450 Spanish, 175 Chinese, and 175 Vietnamese tip cards. The 37 bait shops reached and tip card distribution during the 2022 bait shop outreach in English Spanish, Chinese, and Vietnamese are summarized below.

1. **7 Eleven (Ocean Blvd):** English (50), Spanish (50)
2. **ABC Fine Wine:** Unable to contact
3. **ARCO AM/PM:** English (50), Spanish (50)
4. **Baja Fish Gear:** Enough supplies from previous delivery
5. **Bay Market:** English (50), Spanish (50), Chinese (25), Vietnamese (25)
6. **Best Bait and Tackle:** Enough supplies from previous delivery
7. **Big 5 Sporting Goods:** Enough supplies from previous delivery
8. **Big Fish Bait & Tackle:** Enough supplies from previous delivery
9. **Catalina Liquor & Deli:** Enough supplies from previous delivery
10. **Charkbait:** English (50), Spanish (50), Chinese (25), Vietnamese (25)
11. **Dawn to Dusk Liquor:** Enough supplies from previous delivery
12. **Del Rey Landing:** Enough supplies from previous delivery
13. **El Don Liquor Store:** Unable to contact
14. **Family Deli and Grocery:** Enough supplies from previous delivery
15. **Fishermen's Hardware:** English (50), Spanish (50), Chinese (25), Vietnamese (25)
16. **Gaffey Liquor:** Unable to contact
17. **Hello Liquor:** Enough supplies from previous delivery
18. **Jimmy Caivo Bait & Tackle:** Enough supplies from previous delivery
19. **Let's Go Fishing:** Unable to contact
20. **Liquor Depot:** Unable to contact
21. **M&P Liquor:** Unable to contact
22. **Magnolia Liquor Jr. Market:** Unable to contact
23. **Mahi Tackle-Sport Fishing Supplies:** English (50), Spanish (50), Chinese (25), Vietnamese (25)
24. **Manhattan Grocery:** Enough supplies from previous delivery
25. **Mr. C's Liquor:** Unable to contact
26. **Pacific Edge Bait and Tackle:** Unable to contact
27. **Pacific Wilderness:** Enough supplies from previous delivery
28. **Redondo Food Mart:** Unable to contact
29. **Rosa's Liquor Market:** Unable to contact
30. **Seal Beach Liquor Store:** Enough supplies from previous delivery
31. **Stanley's Liquor Jr. Market:** Unable to contact
32. **Supreme Liquor:** Unable to contact
33. **West Beach Liquor Store:** Unable to contact
34. **West Marine (1):** English (50), Spanish (50), Chinese (25), Vietnamese (25)
35. **West Marine (2):** English (50), Spanish (50), Chinese (25), Vietnamese (25)
36. **West Marine (3):** English (50), Spanish (50), Chinese (25), Vietnamese (25)
37. **West Marine (4):** Unable to contact

Vietnamese Community Outreach by BPSOS – Laura Levine for Hang Nguyn/BPSOS

Ms. Levine summarized the community outreach activities performed by BPSOS since March 2022. She indicated that BPSOS primarily targets health fairs to reach the Vietnamese community. BPSOS attended 4 events with approximately 800 attendees and distributed 322 tip cards in English and Vietnamese. BPSOS reported that the event attendees had limited

awareness of the fish contamination. BPSOS observed that that NOAA's What's the Catch comic book continues to be popular with children and that they need more of these materials. Additionally, BPSOS noted that their fishing game and Booth in the Box are in good condition. However, the information is outdated on the Booth in the Box display board. BPSOS is researching new community events for 2023.

Chinese Community Outreach by CHCC – Laura Levine for Lisa Loo/CHCC

Ms. Levine summarized the community outreach activities performed by CHCC since March 2022. CHCC targets Chinese community events. They attended 3 events with approximately 11,600 attendees and distributed 1,850 tip cards in English and Chinese. CHCC reported that event attendees have limited awareness of fish contamination but are interested in learning more. The attendees find the tip card and fish identification cards the most informative and the fishing game continues to draw attention by families with children. The Booth in the Box and fishing game components need replacement. CHCC anticipates attending the Chinese New Year Fair in San Gabriel in 2023.

5. Open Forum Discussion Topics

- Annual program reports update – Ms. Levine indicated that the annual program reports are being prepared. She encouraged partners to review the annual reports posted on the FCEC website and implement recommendations to improve the outreach program. She requested FCEC Partners help provide feedback and engagement to implement the recommendations.
- Community event sign-in sheets – Ms. Levine mentioned that the sign-in sheet at community events has not been successful at obtaining signatures and tracking awareness.
- Booth in the Box – Ms. Levine mentioned that FCEC partners have requested updates to the display board and replacement of fishing game components.
- Quick Response (QR) codes – Ms. Levine mentioned that FCEC partners have suggested adding QR codes to the Booth in the Box display board, sign-in sheet, and angler/enforcement outreach tally forms with links to the FCEC website and tip cards. Ms. Duarte/EPA suggested that a sticker with a QR code could be placed on the DNC pier signs.
- Enforcement restaurant/market inspections – Ms. Levine stated that the City of Long Beach and LACDPH grants expired, and they are no longer performing enforcement outreach. Ms. Huang asked the FCEC partners to think about and provide any recommendations to EPA about replacing the market/restaurant inspections. She suggested potentially retiring the program because historically there has been frequent turn-over and/or the markets/restaurants often go out of business. There may be a better way to use the funds.
- FCEC website and social media – Ms. Levine encouraged partners to continue providing feedback and engage with social media platforms to improve electronic outreach.
- Outreach material updates – Ms. Levine mentioned that the outreach materials are due for replenishment and updates. FCEC partners have reported additional language

requests (i.e., Korean) during community event and bait shop outreach. Mr. Orrala indicated that there has also been requests for Tagalog language tip cards during the angler outreach. Ms. Huang requested FCEC partners involvement in tracking inventory need and development of the revised outreach materials. In the meantime, Ms. Levine will work with Ms. Hackstedde to share and distribute existing materials among the partners. Ms. Huang also indicated that the goal is coordinate with FCEC partners to print two new outreach materials per year, and they may contain a QR code.

- Booth-in-Box and fishing game updates – The display board, which is part of the Booth-in-Box for the community events needs updating. Specifically, the technical information on the display board could be updated. Ms. Levine requested FCEC partner input on improvements to the display board. Additionally, the children’s fishing games shared among the partners are worn and need replacement.

ACTION ITEMS:

- ***Mr. Orrala/HTB and Ms. Levine/EA to discuss pier signage redistribution and provide options to EPA and FCEC partners.***
- ***Ms. Hackstedde/DBS&A to replace three bait shops that no longer sell bait or closed business in 2023.***
- ***FCEC partners to contact Ms. Levine/EA for print materials inventory and need.***
- ***Ms. Levine/EA to work with FCEC partners to review outreach materials inventory need for the next 6 months, share/distribute materials, and provide information to EPA.***
- ***Ms. Levine/EA to work with FCEC partners to replace broken fishing game and Booth in the Box materials.***
- ***FCEC partners to contact Ms. Jordan Ward/EPA and/or Ms. Levine/EA to provide recommendations to improve the outreach program, help with updating the outreach materials, Booth-in-Box display board, and electronic outreach.***
- ***FCEC partners to think about and provide any recommendations to Ms. Jordan Ward/EPA about replacing the market/restaurant inspections***

6. Meeting Adjournment

Ms. Huang closed the meeting with thanks to all.